



The Manifestation of Persuasion in American Board Missionaries' Publications: The Case of the Greek-Lettered Turkish Children's Magazine *Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçün* [The Messenger for Children]

Amerikan Misyonerlerinin Yayınlarında İkna İlkelerinin Tezahürü: Yunan Alfabetesiyle Yazılmış Türkçe Çocuk Dergisi Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçün Örneği

Hayrullah Kahya*

MAKALE BİLGİSİ

ARTICLE INFO

Araştırma Makalesi Research Article

Sorumlu yazar:

Corresponding author:

* Yıldız Teknik Üniversitesi
hkahya@yildiz.edu.tr

ORCID: 0000-0002-1192-6453

Başvuru / Submitted:

7 Eylül 2023

Kabul / Accepted:

22 Ekim 2023

DOI: 10.21021/osmed.1356794

Atıf/Citation:

Kahya, H. "The Manifestation of Persuasion in American Board Missionaries' Publications: The Case of the Greek-Lettered Turkish Children's Magazine *Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçün*", *Osmanlı Medeniyeti Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 19 (2023): 176-201.

Benzerlik / Similarity: %11

Abstract

In the 19th century, many missionary organizations effectively infiltrated Ottoman society through their missionary activities. Among these organizations, the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (ABCFM), which has been active in Ottoman lands since 1820, stands out as an important missionary institution. Within the framework of its missionary activities, the ABCFM meticulously gathered information about the daily life of Ottoman society and sought to establish meaningful ties with them through educational, health and especially publishing initiatives. The ABCFM primarily focused on non-Muslim communities in Ottoman society, including the Karamanli Orthodox community, which was perceived as Greek due to their religious affiliation. The ABCFM aimed to succeed by converting all target groups, including the Karamanlides, to the Protestant faith. However, achieving this goal depended on their persuasiveness. Therefore, this study focuses on the compliance of ABCFM publications with the principles of persuasion. For this purpose, *Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçün* (The Messenger for Children), an illustrated children's magazine that ABCFM missionaries began publishing in Istanbul as the Greek-lettered Turkish equivalent of the Armenian-lettered Turkish *Avedaper*, was selected as a case study. The study analyzed the first volume of *Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçün* in 1872 in terms of the principles of persuasion. The findings show that the ABCFM largely adhered to the principles of persuasion in *Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçün*. The findings show that ABCFM adhered to persuasive principles to a great extent in *Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçün*. This result can be interpreted as an indication that ABCFM was very meticulous in their publications and that their success was not accidental.

Keywords: American Board, *Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçün*, ABCFM, Karamanlis, 19th century missionaries.

Öz

19. yüzyılda çok sayıda misyoner örgüt, misyonerlik faaliyetleri aracılığıyla Osmanlı toplumuna etkin bir şekilde sızmıştır. Bu örgütler arasında 1820 yılından itibaren Osmanlı topraklarında faaliyet gösteren American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (ABCFM) önemli bir misyonerlik kurumu olarak öne çıkmaktadır. ABCFM, misyonerlik faaliyetleri çerçevesinde Osmanlı toplumunun gündelik yaşamı hakkında titizlikle bilgi toplamış, eğitim, sağlık ve özellikle yayıncılık girişimleriyle onlarla anlamlı bağlar kurmaya çalışmıştır. ABCFM öncelikli olarak Osmanlı toplumundaki gayrimüslim cemaatlere odaklanmış, bu cemaatler arasında dini aidiyetleri nedeniyle Rum olarak algılanan Karamanlı Ortodoks cemaati de yer almıştır. ABCFM, Karamanlılar da dahil olmak üzere tüm hedef grupları Protestan inancına döndürerek başarılı olmayı amaçlamıştır. Ancak bu hedefe ulaşmak ikna kabiliyetlerine bağlıydı. Bu nedenle, bu çalışma ABCFM yayınlarının ikna ilkelerine uygunluğuna odaklanmıştır. Bu amaçla, ABCFM misyonerleri tarafından Ermeni harfleriyle Türkçe olarak yayımlanan Ermeni harfli Türkçe *Avedaper*'in Yunan harfli Türkçe karşılığı olarak İstanbul'da yayımlanmaya başladığı resimli bir çocuk dergisi olan *Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçün* örnek olay olarak seçilmiştir. Çalışma, *Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçün*'ün 1872 tarihli ilk cildini ikna ilkeleri açısından incelemiştir. Bulgular, ABCFM'nin *Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçün*'de ikna edici ilkelere büyük ölçüde bağlı kaldığını göstermektedir. Bu sonuç, ABCFM'nin yayınlarında oldukça titiz davrandıklarını ve başarılarının tesadüfi olmadığını bir göstergesi olarak yorumlanabilir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: American Board, ABCFM, *Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçün*, Karamanlılar, 19. yüzyılda misyonerler.



Introduction

Beginning in the late 18th century and continuing throughout the 19th century, missionary¹ activities in America had the primary goal of fostering a shared identity among the people of the continent². However, driven by the influence of the country's foreign policy³, missionaries expanded their endeavors beyond the confines of the continent⁴. Following the establishment of organizations such as the New York Missionary Society in 1796, the Massachusetts Missionary Society in Boston in 1799, and the Connecticut Missionary Society in 1803⁵, the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (hereafter referred to as ABCFM), founded in Boston in 1810, emerged as the most extensive missionary network beyond the continent⁶. By the year 1868, the ABCFM had reached a point where it could single-handedly cover 30% of the collective expenses of the 16 Protestant missionary organizations within the continent. Moreover, 30% of missionaries worldwide were affiliated under the umbrella of the ABCFM⁷.

The primary objective of the ABCFM's establishment was explicitly stated as the *dissemination of the gospel through preachers, catechists, schoolmasters, and the press among unreached societies*⁸. Thus, the true aim of the activities conducted by American missionaries in areas such as education, publications, and healthcare was not so much to "enlighten" the youth of these communities, but rather to naturally spread Protestantism⁹. In other words, religion was at the core of missionary efforts. Efforts in education, healthcare, the press, and the like were merely tools employed to achieve this objective¹⁰.

According to data highlighted by researchers, it is indicated that the most successful¹¹ and extensive missionary group in the Ottoman Empire was the American Board of Protestant Missionaries. In the last quarter of the 19th century, the influence of the ABCFM in Ottoman territories exhibited significant increases, with a growth rate of 38% in expansion, 40% in American staff, and a notable 78% in native staff¹². However, there is no consensus among researchers regarding the level of success achieved by the ABCFM in Ottoman territories or whether it was

¹ According to the ABCFM documents, voluntarism is essential in missionary work. In line with Jesus's command "Go, spread the truth," individuals who aim to be responsible to Jesus and serve the Bible voluntarily are referred to as missionaries, and their activities are termed missions. See Uygur Kocabaşoğlu, *Anadolu'daki Amerika – Kendi Belgeleriyle 19. Yüzyılda Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'ndaki Amerikan Misyoner Okulları*. 4. bs. (Ankara: İmge Kitabevi, 2023), 32.

² Nazan Kahraman, "Amerikan Protestan Misyonerlerin Osmanlı Coğrafyasına Yönelik İlk Matbaası Malta (1822-1833)", *Ankara Üniversitesi İlel Dergisi* 7/1 (2020): 96-136; Necmettin Tozlu, *Kültür ve Eğitim Tarihimizde Yabancı Okullar*. (Ankara: Akçağ Yayınları, 1991).

³ Kocabaşoğlu, *age*, 2023.

⁴ Sharkey, in the 19th century, attributes the acceleration of missionary activities to several factors. These include the prevalent practice of individual religious freedom in America during that time (Religious Free Choice), the growing affection and encouragement towards missionaries among Americans (Mission Enthusiasm), the perception of missions as a form of entertainment or adventure (Missions as Entertainment), the presence of sacred locations mentioned in the Bible within Ottoman territories (Biblicism or Bibliolatry), the belief in the second coming of Jesus in the holy lands (Millenarianism), and advancements in communication and transportation technologies. See Heather J Sharkey, "American Missionaries in Ottoman Lands: Foundational Encounters", (2010 Jan), (Access on 20.07.2023)

⁵ Celal Öney, *Osmanlı Suriyesi'nde misyonerlik faaliyetleri* (Ankara: Maarif Mektepleri, 2019).

⁶ Ayhan Öztürk, "American Board"ın Kuruluşu, Teşkilatlanması Ve Osmanlı Devletinde Kurduğu Misyonlar", *Erciyes Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 2, (2007): 63-74.

⁷ Kocabaşoğlu, *ibid*, 2023, 15.

⁸ *Constitutions, laws and regulations of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions* (Boston, 1839), 6.

⁹ Yusuf Ziya Karabıçak, "Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçin ve Osmanlı Devleti'nde Yayınlanan Diğer Çocuk Gazeteleri: Modern Çocukluk Söyleminin Oluşumu," *Toplumsal Tarih*, 215 (2011): 3.

¹⁰ Kocabaşoğlu, *ibid*, 2023, 15.

¹¹ Gülbadi Alan, "Protestan Amerikan Misyonerleri, Anadolu'daki Rumlar ve Pontus Meselesi." *Erciyes Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi* 10 (2001): 183-208; Hüseyin Canyaş and F. Orkunt Canyaş "Osmanlı'dan Günümüze Misyonerlerin Kültürel Alandaki Faaliyetleri." *Türklük Bilimi Araştırmaları (TÜBAR)* 31 (2012): 55-75.

¹² Kocabaşoğlu, *ibid*, 2023, 110.

successful at all. Some argue that missionaries were unsuccessful, pointing out that the transition of the local population to Protestantism did not meet the desired levels. On the other hand, certain events such as Greece's independence process (1821-1830) and the Armenian incidents of the 1890s are considered by some researchers as a form of success in missionary activities. Nonetheless, a definite truth is that these activities significantly impacted the viewpoints, perspectives, and practices of all involved parties¹³.

The literature review¹⁴ demonstrates a series of studies focusing on various significant aspects of American missionaries in Ottoman territories. Particularly, there are numerous works that delve into the formation, functioning, personnel, and general activities of the organization¹⁵. Additionally, the educational and healthcare efforts of American missionaries have been notably examined by many researchers¹⁶. However, studies concerning the press activities of missionaries hold a relatively limited position compared to other topics¹⁷. Some studies concentrating on American missionaries specifically emphasize American sources¹⁸, while others rely more heavily on Turkish sources¹⁹. These differing approaches are valuable in comprehending the state of missionary activities during the period, their impacts on the local population, their contributions to the Ottoman modernization process, and their influence on the formation of the contemporary world. These studies not only illuminate the complexity and diversity of the activities carried out by missionaries in Ottoman territories but also reveal their historical, societal, and cultural contexts. Also, these studies contribute to a better understanding of the role of American missionaries in the Ottoman Empire, aiding in the evaluation of historical developments within a broader framework.

Missionaries' activities in the fields of education and health are often more heavily scrutinized, perhaps because education and health activities by their very nature produce more tangible and observable results, have a more significant impact on society, and are therefore easier to focus on.

¹³ Sharkey, *ibid*, (2010 Jan), 2-3. (Access on 20.07.2023)

¹⁴ For a study conducted on the bibliometric analysis of research related to American missionaries see Büşra Saatci İzci ve Hicran Hanım Halaç, "Bibliometric Analysis of The American Board Missionary Organization," *Turkish Academic Research Review*, 7/1 (2022): 97-118.

¹⁵ e.g. Mehmet Ali Doğan and Heather J. Sharkey (eds.) *American Missionaries in the Middle East: Foundational Encounters* (Salt Lake City: The University of Utah Press, 2011); William R. Hutchison, 1987. *Errand to the World: American Protestant Thought and Foreign Missions*. (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1987); Hans-Lukas Kieser, *Nearest East: American Millennialism and Mission to the Middle East*. (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2010); Melani McAlister, *Epic Encounters: Culture, Media, and U.S. Interests in the Middle East, 1945-2000*. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001); Ussama Makdisi, *Artillery of Heaven: American Missionaries and the Failed Conversion of the Middle East*. (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2008); Erol Güngör, *Türkiye'de Misyonerlik Faaliyetleri*. (İstanbul: Ötüken, 1999); Julius Richter, *A History of Protestant Missions in The Near East*, (London, 1910); Gülbadi Alan, "Amerikan Board Örgütünün Dünyası". *Osmanlı'dan Cumhuriyet'e Türkiye'de Misyonerler ve Faaliyetleri*, ed., Yunus Emre Tekinsoy, Murat Hanılçe (İstanbul: Kitabevi Yayınları, 2018), 55-95; Kocabaşoğlu, *age*, 2023.

¹⁶ e.g. see Gülbadi Alan, *Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda Amerikan Protestan Okulları* (Ankara: TTK, 2015); Ayşe Aksu, Robert Kolej'in İzinde – Türkiye'de Amerikan Misyonerliğinin Eğitim Stratejisi. (İstanbul: Dergah, 2017); Frank A. Stone, (2023). *Sömürgeciliğin Hasat Mevsimi* Anadolu'da Amerikan Misyoner Okulları. trans. Ayşe Aksu (İstanbul: Dergah, 2023); Gülbadi Alan, Merzifon Amerikan Koleji ve Anadolu'daki Etkileri (Ankara: TTK, 2008a); Faruk Taşkın, "Amerikan Board Misyonerlerinin Türkiye'deki Sağlık Faaliyetleri (1833-1923)", *Avrasya İncelemeleri Dergisi*, VI/2 (2017): 149-176; İdris Yücel, "Anadolu'daki Amerikan Hastaneleri ve Tıbbi Misyonerlik (1880-1930)", (PhD Thesis, Hacettepe University, 2011); Ayşe Aksu, "The Education Activities of American Missionaries in Ottoman Anatolia (1820-1900) and its Effects on Ottoman Social Structure" (PhD Thesis, Marmara University, 2010).

¹⁷ For studies that focus on printing activities of American missionaries e.g. see Uygur Kocabaşoğlu, "Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda XIX. yüzyılda Amerikan matbaaları ve Yayıncılığı", *Murat Sarıca Armağanı*, eds., Aydın Aybay ve Rona Aybay (İstanbul: Aybay Yayınları, 1988), 267-287; James Coakley, "Printing offices of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions, 1816-1900: A synopsis," *Harvard Library Bulletin* 9/1 (Spring 1998): 5-34; Geoffrey Roper, "The beginnings of Arabic printing by the ABCFM, 1822-1841", *Harvard Library Bulletin* 9/1 (Spring 1998): 50-68; Kahraman, *agm*, 2020.

¹⁸ e.g. see İdris Yücel, "Kendi Belgeleri Işığında Amerikan Boardın Osmanlı Ülkesindeki Teşkilatlanması", (yüksek lisans tezi, Erciyes Üniversitesi, 2005); Ayşe Aksu, *Osmanlı'da İki Amerikalı Misyoner Levi Parsons ve Pliny Fisk'in Anadolu ve Kudüs Seyahat Raporları* (İstanbul: Dergah, 2015); Kocabaşoğlu, *age*, 2023.

¹⁹ e.g. see Gülbadi Alan, *Misyonerlik Karşısında Osmanlı Devleti'nin Politikaları* (Kayseri: Arka Oda Yayınları, 2008b); Gülbadi Alan, "Sultan II. Abdülhamid'in Hıristiyan Misyonerleri ve Kurumlarına Karşı Takip Ettiği Politikalar", *Devr-i Hamid – Sultan II. Abdülhamid*, ed. Metin Hülagü (Kayseri: Erciyes Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2011), 213-256; Emrah Şahin, *Faithful Encounters: Authorities and American Missionaries in the Ottoman Empire* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2018).

However, other areas, such as the press activities of missionaries, are also important and worth examining for a broader understanding. Press activities can influence cultural interactions, communication, and the spread of ideas in significant ways²⁰. Understanding the interaction and communication of missionaries with local communities can help us understand their motivations and goals in a more holistic way. Therefore, it would be useful to conduct more research on the media activities of missionaries. Such research can play a critical role in understanding how missionaries approach communities, which media outlets they use, what kind of content they produce, and what kind of impact they have. In this way, we can gain a better understanding of all aspects of missionary activities and get a more holistic picture.

ABCFM's publications fundamentally carry the objectives of "religious agitation" and "propaganda"²¹. Considering this, it is of great importance to examine the strategies adopted by these publications to persuade the reader. Although there are some explanations²² in the literature regarding how American missionaries aimed to construct an identity through education, there has been a relatively limited detailed analysis of the persuasive principles of missionary publications. However, it is evident that the primary goal of ABCFM's publications is, by nature, to persuade readers to accept Protestantism. In this context, a significant portion of these publications **are** observed to possess religious and educational qualities. Therefore, addressing the persuasion strategies of these publications holds significant importance.

This study, undertaken to address this gap, examines the illustrated children's magazine titled *Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçin*, which commenced publication in Istanbul in 1872. The purpose of this study is to analyze how the texts within AÇİ are designed in terms of persuasive principles. Through this analysis, a better understanding of the persuasive ability of American missionary publications on their target audience can be achieved using the example of AÇİ. Furthermore, this study will establish a foundation and data source for future research on the persuasive nature of ABCFM's publications, thereby contributing to the accumulation of knowledge in the relevant field.

A Brief Overview of ABCFM's Relations with the Indigenous Greeks in Anatolia

The entrance of the rapidly growing and expanding ABCFM missionaries into Ottoman territories dates back to the 1820s. While the initially targeted region for the missionaries arriving in Izmir was the Bible Land, their ultimate aim encompassed the Anatolian lands²³. Upon reaching the Anatolian territories, the missionaries encountered a diverse array of individuals comprising men, women, and children; Muslims, Christians, Jews; the affluent and the impoverished; the healthy and the infirm; Turks, Arabs, Armenians, Greeks, and various other ethnic groups²⁴. Within missionary records, there are notations indicating the assignment of missionaries to specific groups such as Greeks, Armenians, Jews, Bulgarians, and others²⁵. These records underscore that

²⁰ For certain research pertaining to American missionaries' printing activities e.g. see Uygur Kocabaşoğlu, "Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda XIX. yüzyılda Amerikan matbaaları ve Yayımcılığı", *Murat Sarıca Armağanı*, eds., Aydın Aybay ve Rona Aybay (İstanbul: Aybay Yayınları, 1988), 267-287; James Coakley, "Printing offices of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions, 1816-1900: A synopsis," *Harvard Library Bulletin* 9/1 (Spring 1998): 5-34; Geoffrey Roper, "The beginnings of Arabic printing by the ABCFM, 1822-1841", *Harvard Library Bulletin* 9/1 (Spring 1998): 50-68; Kahraman, *agm*, 2020.

²¹ Kocabaşoğlu, *age*, 2023, 113.

²² e.g. see Aksu, *ibid*, 2010. According to Aksu, the ABCFM aims to establish a novel Christian model through its educational endeavors, promoting virtues such as piety, honesty, kindness, and abstinence from alcohol. Simultaneously, it aspires to cultivate an identity that embraces the American way of life through missionary activities.

²³ Kahraman, *ibid*, 2020.

²⁴ Sharkey, *ibid*, (2010 Jan). (Access on 20.07.2023)

²⁵ Kocabaşoğlu, *ibid*, 2023, 30.

missionaries arriving in Anatolia at various times particularly concentrated their efforts on the non-Muslim communities among these groups. The missionaries' specific focus on these groups can be attributed to both the religious distinctions within these communities and the underlying social dynamics²⁶.

According to Eddy²⁷, the primary objective of missionaries arriving in Ottoman territories during the 19th century was to facilitate the conversion of individuals from various religious backgrounds, particularly focusing on the Jewish community initially, to the Protestant faith²⁸. In regions densely populated by the Muslim community, where the Islamic sharia prohibited religious conversion, American missionaries faced challenges in achieving their intended success²⁹. Consequently, they began to direct their efforts towards Eastern Christians³⁰ (e.g. Armenian, Greek, Maronite, Nestorian, etc.³¹), especially considering the Islamic limitations. Among these efforts, they achieved more success with Armenians and Nestorians³². Nonetheless, they continued their efforts among the Greek population as well. In fact, according to some scholars³³, the initial scope of ABCFM's objectives encompassed the Greek community, including³⁴ the Karamanlides³⁵. In this context, upon their arrival in Izmir in 1820, American missionaries established close communication with the Greeks and significantly contributed to Greek education through the schools they established. Throughout the entire century, Greeks showed relatively less interest in religious activities compared to Armenians; however, they continued to benefit from educational services, sometimes on a fee basis.³⁶

Starting from the 1830s, the Greek population under the influence of the Greek Orthodox Patriarchate responded unfavorably to missionary activities, leading to a deterioration of relations with the missionaries³⁷. According to Alan³⁸, the initially positive trajectory of the fifteen-year relationship between the Greek Orthodox Patriarchate and American missionaries began to sour,

²⁶ Sharkey, *ibid*, (2010 Jan). (Access on 20.07.2023)

²⁷ David Brewer Eddy (1913). *What next in Turkey - Glimpses of the American Board's work in the Near East*. (Boston: American Board, 1913).

²⁸ Öney, *ibid*, 2019.

²⁹ Noticing this, missionaries compelled the Ottoman government to endorse religious freedom by leveraging the power of Western states, predominantly that of the British. See Sharkey, *ibid*, (2010 Jan). (Access on 20.07.2023)

³⁰ Kocabaşoğlu, *ibid*, 2023, 31;

³¹ Şamil Mutlu, *Osmanlı Devleti'nde Misyoner Okulları* (İstanbul: Gökkuşbu, 2005), 374.

³² Öney, *ibid*, 2019.

³³ Karabıçak, *ibid*, 2011, 3.

³⁴ In the Ottoman Empire, which was a society based on religion, the Karamanlis were considered as part of the Greek Orthodox community. That's why, during the Exchange of Populations in 1923, they were sent to Greece along with the Greeks. See Cami Baykurt, *Osmanlı Ülkesinde Hristiyan Türkler*. (İstanbul: Sanayiinefise Matbaası, 1932), 19.

³⁵ In the academic literature, the term "Karamanlis" generally refers to a populace that predominantly inhabited Central Anatolia but was also present throughout the entirety of Anatolia and the Balkans. This community, commonly associated with the Orthodox Christian denomination, is characterized by its exclusive proficiency in the Turkish language. As previously addressed in another study the academic literature concerning the origins of the Karamanli people is marked by two principal perspectives. According to the first viewpoint, the Karamanlis are originally of Greek descent, and due to their geographical isolation from Greek-speaking communities in Western Anatolia, they gradually abandoned the Greek language over time. On the contrary, the second perspective contends that the Karamanlis are inherently Turkish. It asserts that prior to the conquest of Anatolia, some Turks, serving as mercenaries under the command of the Byzantine Empire, underwent a transformation in their religious affiliations, either by voluntarily changing their faith or through Christianization. Consequently, they evolved into Turkish-speaking communities. Researchers advocating for the second perspective argue that the Karamanlis have Turkish roots (Hayrullah Kahya, "Karamanlıca Bir Kitap Yeni Hazne Ve Dil Özellikleri (İmlâ Özellikleri Ve Ses Bilgisi)", *Turkish Studies* 3/6(2008): 368). For further information regarding the Karamanlis, e.g. see Yonca Anzerlioğlu, "Tarihi verilerle Karamanlı Ortodoks Türkler", *Türk Kültürü ve Hacı Bektaş Veli Araştırma Dergisi*, 51, (2009):171-188; Yonca Anzerlioğlu, *Karamanlı Ortodoks Türkler*. (Ankara: Phoenix, 2016); Evangelia Balta (ed.) *Gerçi Rum İsek de, Rumca Bilmez Türkçe Söyleriz: Karamanlılar ve Karamanlıca Edebiyat Üzerine Araştırmalar*, (İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Kültür Yayınları, 2012); Gazanfer İbar, *Gazanfer Anadolu Hemşehrilerimiz - Karamanlılar ve Yunan Harfli Türkçe* (İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Kültür Yayınları, 2018); Hayrullah Kahya, "Grek Harfli Osmanlı Türkçesi Bir Eser: spat-ı Mesihîye Üzerinde Dil İncelemesi", (Yüksek Lisans Tezi, Fatih Üniversitesi, 2003); Mehmet Eröz, *Hristiyanlaşan Türkler*, (Ankara: Türk Kültürünü Araştırma Enstitüsü, 1983); Baykurt, *ibid.*, 1932.

³⁶ Alan, *ibid*, 2001.

³⁷ Öney, *ibid*, 2019.

³⁸ Alan, *ibid*, 2001.

following the establishment of the new independent state of Greece. Initially, due to their rebellion against the Ottoman Empire, the Greeks found themselves in a challenging economic and social situation, prompting them to welcome missionary assistance during this period. However, after achieving independence, the Greeks managed to improve their circumstances and began to perceive that they no longer required the assistance of missionaries. This transformation constitutes one of the key factors underlying the changes in the relationship between missionary activities and the Greek community.

However, caution should be exercised when accepting this view, as the deterioration of relations between local sects and American missionaries is not confined to the Greek Orthodox Church³⁹. Intense conflicts have also arisen between other local churches (such as the Maronite Church and the Armenian Apostolic Church) and American missionaries. These local churches have realized that the primary aim of American missionaries is to draw local Christians towards the Protestant faith through education, and as a result, they have forbidden their members from establishing relationships with American missionaries. They have reacted strongly against those who didn't adhere to these prohibitions, and many of them have even been expelled from their religious communities⁴⁰.

Starting from the mid-1840s, with Dr. Goodell offering religious services in Turkish in Istanbul, the interest in the Protestant denomination among the Ottoman Greeks was revitalized as some Greeks began attending his meetings. By the year 1850, the group of Greeks numbered more than forty, and their desire to pray in their own language led to the initiation of Greek-language services by the missionary Mr. Van Lennep. However, this proved insufficient, and in 1851, Panayotes Constantinides was appointed by the missionaries to conduct prayers, thus becoming the first Greek Protestant minister. With the official recognition of the Protestant community in the Ottoman Empire in 1851, the reports of the missionaries in Anatolia started to highlight successes among the Greeks, and positive outcomes began to emerge from the activities conducted among them⁴¹. According to Alan, a prominent researcher renowned for his significant contributions to missionary studies, during this period, the significance of the modern and high-quality education provided by the American Board missionaries was better understood by the Greeks, leading to the realization of the necessity to benefit from these services. Consequently, a more positive attitude toward the missionaries began to resurface. However, it's essential to consider that the establishment of Protestant churches by the Greeks within Ottoman territories and their official recognition by the Ottoman state also played a significant role in this process. Through the registration of these "officially recognized" Protestant Churches, native Christians who had been excommunicated from their original churches found relief from social exclusion and loneliness. Finding a new refuge, the transition of these native Christians to Protestantism was facilitated⁴².

The ABCFM missionaries directed their efforts towards the Karamanli community in Anatolia, who resided in the region and knew no language other than Turkish, writing their texts in the Greek alphabet. As a result of these activities, following the Ottoman Empire's recognition of Protestantism as a distinct *millet* (nation), the Protestant church established in Izmir in 1850 garnered interest not only from the local population but also from the Karamanlı people residing in different areas such

³⁹ Kocabaşoğlu, *ibid*, 2023, 77.

⁴⁰ Öney, *ibid*, 2019.

⁴¹ Alan, *ibid*, 2001.

⁴² Öney, *ibid*, 2019.

as Inner Anatolia and Western Anatolia. Within this context, the participation of a limited number of Karamanli individuals in William Goodell's events in Istanbul in 1846, where he delivered sermons in Turkish to Armenians, was interpreted by missionaries as a sign of Karamanli's interest in the Protestant faith⁴³. However, it is well-known that a significant portion of the Karamanli population, influenced in part by the Greek Orthodox Patriarchate of Constantinople, exhibited a cautious stance toward Protestant missionary activities, adopting a competitive attitude⁴⁴. This sentiment was most notably reflected in the actions of Karamanli intellectuals, who produced cautionary and protective publications against Protestant missionaries⁴⁵. Furthermore, in the publications after the 1820s when Protestant missionaries began operating in Anatolia, an intriguing shift occurred. While earlier the readers were generally addressed as "Christians," these publications started to address them as "Orthodox Christians" to emphasize the Orthodox Christian faith, highlighting the importance of this distinction⁴⁶.

Moreover, the fact that the subscriber count of AÇİ, which was voluntarily purchased for a certain fee⁴⁷, never exceeded five hundred, can be interpreted as another indication of the limited impact of Protestant missionaries among the Karamanli population. Despite its efforts to underscore the significance of AÇİ and sustain its publication, the likely reason for the cessation of the magazine is predominantly attributed to financial constraints⁴⁸. Additionally, considering that the version printed in the Armenian alphabet, Avedaper, continued until 1915⁴⁹, it becomes evident that this version persisted for at least ten more years than the version printed in the Greek alphabet, AÇİ. This observation further supports the stated evaluation. Nonetheless, it is important to acknowledge that Orthodoxy is an integral component of Greek identity; however, during the wartime context, a partial convergence between Orthodox adherents and Protestants emerged against a "common enemy" should also be kept in mind⁵⁰. Despite all these factors, it can be asserted that the influence of Protestant missionaries on the Karamanli population was comparatively constrained when juxtaposed with their impact on the Armenians⁵¹.

Publication Activities of ABCFM Missionaries among the Karamanli Community

According to the Annual Reports, ABCFM missionaries prioritized the establishment of printing presses within Ottoman territories. This decision was driven by their awareness of the significance of disseminating missionary activities by distributing sacred scriptures and pamphlets in the region. In this context, they aimed to establish printing presses as a means to reach a broader audience with the Protestant faith. ABCFM missionaries viewed preaching as a foundational tool, while also considering education and printing as supportive elements. In other words, printing presses were deemed crucial instruments to facilitate the spread of sacred texts and education, serving as a significant means to advocate for missionary endeavors across diverse languages and

⁴³ Alan, *ibid*, 2001.

⁴⁴ Anzerlioğlu, *ibid*, 2016, 181-182.

⁴⁵ For more detailed information regarding the Karamanlides' efforts in countering missionary propaganda see Stefo Benlisoy "Education in the Turcophone Orthodox Communities of Anatolia During in the Nineteenth Century" (PhD diss., Boğaziçi University, 2010), 260-277.

⁴⁶ Evangelia Balta, "Anadolu Türkofon Hıristiyan Ortodoksların Ulusal Bilinçlerini Araştırmaya Yarayan Bir Kaynak Olarak Karamanlıca Kitapların Önsözleri", trans. Herkül Milas, *Tarih ve Toplum*, 74, (1990): 19; Evangelia Balta, "A notebook on the History of the Karamanli Press", (Eds.). Evangelia Balta, G. Salakidis and T. Stavrides, In *Studies Ottoman Empire and Turkey*. İstanbul: The Isis Press, 2014.

⁴⁷ Karabıçak, *ibid*, 2011, 3.

⁴⁸ Stelios Irakleous, "Sociolinguistic Aspects of Αγγελιαφόρος Τζοτζουκλάρ ιτζούν 1872-1896," Ed. Evangelia Balta, In *Cultural Encounters in the Turkish-Speaking Communities of the Late Ottoman Empire* (İstanbul: Isis Press, 2014a), 394-395;

⁴⁹ ARIT-I: <http://dlir.org/eresources/93-american-board-periodical-collection.html> (Access on 27.07.2021)

⁵⁰ Gülen Göktürk, "Well-Preserved Boundaries: Faith and Co-Existence in the Late Ottoman Empire" (PhD diss., Middle East Technical University, 2015), 290-291.

⁵¹ Benlisoy, *ibid*, 2010, 277.

cultures in various geographic regions. This approach thus engendered the belief that even during periods of missionary inactivity, Protestantism could still be propagated through the medium of printing presses⁵².

The foundation of ABCFM's publication efforts, which significantly contributed to the spread of Protestantism in Turkey⁵³, was established in Malta in 1822⁵⁴. During this period, the publications produced in the printing press established in Malta were distributed through missionaries operating within Ottoman territories. Within the initial four and a half years after its establishment, approximately 8 million (211,850 copies) print jobs were completed, demonstrating the highly active nature of the Malta printing press. In tandem with political and social changes, the printing press was relocated to Izmir in 1833 and subsequently transferred to Istanbul after 1853. According to missionary records, activities continued intensely in both Izmir and Istanbul. Throughout this process, around 20 million pages of printing were executed, which roughly translates to about 200,000 volumes of printed materials or approximately 200 publications. Considering that the number of books printed in Ottoman territories between 1729 and 1839 was believed to be fewer than 500, the vigorous operation of the Izmir printing press within a span of 20 years becomes even more apparent with its production of around 200 publications. Upon its relocation to Istanbul, the printing press's activities gained further momentum, leading to the need for establishing new printing presses in regions such as Antep⁵⁵ and Beirut.

By the late 19th century, it is known that ABCFM had expanded to publish in 23 different languages, with a notable portion of these diverse publications taking place within Ottoman territories. According to ABCFM's records, between 1866 and 1897, a total of 249 books in Armenian-scripted Turkish, Armenian, Bulgarian, Greek-scripted Turkish, Arabic-scripted Turkish, and Greek were published, and out of these, 41 (16.47%) were printed in Greek-scripted Turkish. Furthermore, from 1822 to 1881, among a total of 725 books, brochures, pamphlets, and similar publications printed in Armenian, Armenian-scripted Turkish, Greek, Greek-scripted Turkish, Bulgarian, Italian, Arabic-scripted Turkish, and Ladino, there were 32 (4.41%) publications in Greek-scripted Turkish. According to ABCFM records, printing and publishing activities within Ottoman territories continued "at a sustained pace" until the outbreak of the First World War⁵⁶. Throughout this period, while the printing of books in Greek-scripted Turkish may have experienced occasional fluctuations, the overall presence of such publications endured⁵⁷. One of these notable works is the illustrated children's magazine named "AÇI," which forms the foundational material of this article and was specifically designed for Karamanlı children.

⁵² Kahraman, *ibid*, 2020, 101. Kahraman notes that in letters written to the Board by the British clergyman Williamson as early as the 1820s, the significance of the printing press is discussed, and this matter is addressed in the annual reports of the year 1856.

⁵³ Öztürk, *ibid*, 2007.

⁵⁴ Fundamentally, Protestant missionaries who published the first newspaper in Bulgarian and the second newspaper in Armenian are regarded as pioneers of periodical publications in the Ottoman Empire. Johann Strauss, "Who Read What in the Ottoman Empire (19th-20th Centuries)?" *Middle Eastern Literatures*, 6/1 (2003): 43

⁵⁵ Kocabaşoğlu, *ibid*, 2023, 38, 65.

⁵⁶ Kocabaşoğlu, *ibid*, 2023, 112-114.

⁵⁷ However, it appears that they never held a prominent position among the total publications. In fact, they typically ranked towards the end. This situation must be related to the population of the Karamanlides.

The AÇI in Light of Cialdini's Principles of Persuasion

This study is qualitative research based on document analysis. The primary data source for the study is the monthly publication AÇI, spanning the years 1872 to 1895 (or 1905?⁵⁸), which targeted Turkish-speaking Christian Orthodox children in Anatolia and was composed in Turkish using Greek letters (Karamanlidika)⁵⁹. The magazine covers topics such as Christian values, morality, and scientific subjects, using an authoritative narrative style. It was printed in Istanbul by ABCFM missionaries. It is known that AÇI covered the same content in Armenian, published as *Avedaper*, in Armenian-scripted Turkish, and after 1874, in Bulgarian under the name *Zornitsa*⁶⁰.

Based on the fact that each volume of the magazine contains similar content⁶¹ and only the first volume has been published so far, this study is limited to examining solely the first volume published in 1872. This first volume was studied, transcribed, indexed, and reproduced as a facsimile by Kahya⁶² in 2017, and this published work has been used in the study. The data was analyzed using the descriptive analysis method. Additionally, the persuasive techniques identified in the study have been evaluated within the context of Cialdini's principles of persuasion, considering Cialdini's⁶³ prominent position as a leading researcher in the field of persuasion psychology.

According to Cialdini, establishing a positive reciprocal relationship is the first step in persuading people. Creating a positive connection is crucial for the initiation and continuation of communication. At the beginning of a relationship, persuasion should focus on the principles of *reciprocity* and *liking*. Employing the technique of "giving before receiving" in a meaningful, unexpected, and personalized manner, emphasizing similarities, offering sincere compliments, and making the recipient feel understood and shared can enhance the success of persuasion. However, reciprocity and liking alone are not sufficient for successful persuasion. People with a positive relationship with the communicator need to determine whether the change is rational and intelligent before they commit to it. At this stage, focusing on the principles of *authority* and *social proof* is appropriate. It would be necessary to demonstrate that experts and authorities have established the necessity of the change and that most people follow such directives. To ensure the success of persuasion it is crucial to direct attention towards the principles of *scarcity* and *consistency* as a means of motivating the recipient. Reminding the recipient of their previous statements or actions related to the subject to persuade them to embrace the change, highlighting potential losses if they resist change, or demonstrating these losses can play a role in persuading the recipient. In addition

⁵⁸ This uncertainty might stem from the notion that not all issues of the magazine are accessible. Furthermore, no corroborating information has been found in another source regarding the magazine's issues.

⁵⁹ Between the years 1869 and 1905, the children's magazines published in Arabic-script Turkish are as follows: Mümeyyiz (1869-1870), Hazîne-yi Etfâl (1873-1874), Sadâkat-Etfâl (1875), Âyine (1875-1876), Arkadaş (1876), Tercümân-ı Hakikat (1880), Âile (1880), Bâğçe (1880-1881), Mecmûa-yı Nevresidegân (1881), Çocuklara Arkadaş (1881), Çocuklara Kırâat (1881), Vâsita-yı Terakkî (1882), Etfâl (1886), Nümüne-yi Terakkî (1887), Debistân-ı Hired (1887), Çocuklara Ta'lim (1887), Çocuklara Mahsûs Gazete (1896), Çocuklara Rehber (1897), Çocuk Bâğçesi (1905) (Eray Yılmaz, "Türkçe çocuk gazetelerinde Osmanlı kimliği (1869-1908) (Ahlak, ilim, dil, tarih ve coğrafya)", PhD. Diss., Yıldız Technical University, 2015, 80).

⁶⁰ Janos Eckmann, (1991), "Karaman Edebiyatı", In *Türk Dünyası Edebiyatı I*, prep. Halil Açıkgöz, (İstanbul: Türk Dünyası Araştırmaları Vakfı, 1991), 20-37; Balta, *ibid*, 1990; İbar, *ibid*, 2010; Hayrullah Kahya, *Karamanlıca Resimli Bir Çocuk Dergisi: Angeliarforos Çocuklar İçin (1872)*. (Ankara: Grafiker Yayınları, 2017); Balta, *ibid*, 2014; Irakleous, *ibid*, 2014a; Irakleous, *ibid*, 2014b.

⁶¹ Irakleous (2014b) and Altuntaş (2021) demonstrate through their studies that the content of the journal has not undergone significant changes over the years. For instance, an examination of the texts in the 12th issue of the 1896 volume of the journal reveals that, in addition to general cultural information, the majority of the texts are related to the Christian religion (see Mehmet Altuntaş, "Karamanlı Türkçesinde Yayınlanan Angeliarforos Çocuklar İçin (1872-1896) Dergisinin Analitik Bibliyografyası", MA Thesis, Kırklareli University, 2021, pp.621-623).

⁶² Kahya, *ibid*, 2017.

⁶³ Robert B. Cialdini, *İknaya Açılan Kapı*. (Trans. Taner Gezer). (İstanbul: MediaCat Kitapları, 2017); Robert B. Cialdini, *İknanın Psikolojisi*. (Trans. Fevzi Yalın). (İstanbul: MediaCat Kitapları, 2023).

to these principles, being *together* and *acting in unity* is also highly effective in the success of persuasion⁶⁴.

1. Principle of Reciprocity

The principle of reciprocity is the foundational principle of persuasion. According to this principle, regardless of culture, individuals tend to accept offers from those whom they feel indebted to. Creating a sense of indebtedness through the tactic of "giving before receiving" forms the core of the reciprocity technique. The effectiveness of this technique is enhanced when the act of giving is meaningful and unexpected, tailored to address a person's unique need. In other words, when the given item or favor is delivered in an unforeseen time or place and is aligned with the recipient's context, functionality, usefulness, and practicality, the likelihood of persuading the recipient increases. Similarly, when the given items cater to the recipient's specific needs or make them feel special, it significantly contributes to the communicator's success in persuasion⁶⁵.

In the opening segment of the first issue of the initial volume of AÇİ, an account of the rescue of an American sentenced to execution in Cuba by American and British consuls is presented. The passage concludes by asserting the role of Christ in saving individuals from eternal death, addressing the reader in the following manner:

*İmdi çocuklar, bu tasvire bakıb bir kerre düşünin ki o adem ölümden kurtulduğu için nasıl seviniyor! Biz de kurtarıcımız İsus Hristos'a ne kadar teşekkür etmeliyiz ki bizi kurtarmak için ömrünü uğrumuza kurban etdi*⁶⁶.

"Now, children, look at this picture and think once: how happy that man is because he survived death! We should also thank our savior Jesus Christ very much because he sacrificed his life to save us."

In this passage, the intention is to make readers feel indebted to Christ in order to persuade them to his messages. Christ sacrificed his own life to save people from eternal death. A reader who believes in this will find it easier to be persuaded by Christ's messages. This is because Christ has "given before receiving." And what he has given is his most valuable possession, his life. This aspect enhances the value and impact of the felt indebtedness, serving as a significant detail. Moreover, what is given is salvation from eternal death, which is highly significant and valuable for everyone.

The same technique has been used in the following passage:

*Dua ve ibadet etmeye şimdiye dek kayretsiz bulduğunuz ise şimden sonra kayrete gelmelisiniz. Kurtarıcınız İsus'un davetlerini ve nasihatlarını hususa günahlarınızdan dolayı müstahakk olduğunuz ebedi azabdan kurtulmanız için onun damla damla yere dökülen ve ol örtülü stavrosu kırmızıya boyayan kıymetli kanını hatrımıza getirin*⁶⁷.

"If you have been reluctant to pray and worship until now, you must now become motivated. Remember the invitations and advice of your Savior Jesus, especially his precious blood that was shed drop by drop onto the ground and dyed his covered cross red, so that you can be saved from the eternal torment you deserve due to your sins."

⁶⁴ Cialdini, *ibid*, 2017; Cialdini, *ibid*, 2023.

⁶⁵ Cialdini, *ibid*, 2017, 183-188.

⁶⁶ AÇİ, 1872, 1a/22-29

⁶⁷ AÇİ, 1872, 2a/35-44

In this passage as well, the aim is for children to feel indebted to Christ. Christ has shed his blood for them selflessly. As a result, readers are expected to put in more effort to follow Christ's messages, pray, and engage in worship.

Another example of this technique in AÇİ is as follows:

Çocuklar İçin Angelioforos ayda bir kerre neşrolunub senevi fiyatı bir çeryek mecrediye yahod temiz para olarak 5 guruş ise de bir mahalde kendi ismine 25 nushe birden alan yalnız bir lira verecekdir⁶⁸.

"Angelioforos for Children is published once a month, and its annual price is a quarter Macidiya or exactly 5 qurush. However, if you purchase 25 copies at once from a single location in your own name, you will only pay one lira."

In this passage, a meaningful and unexpected discount is offered to encourage readers to purchase more magazines, aiming to persuade them. Here, a material (e.g. the magazine) of personal interest is presented at a discounted price.

In another section where the importance of helping mothers is emphasized, the indebtedness of children to their mothers is expressed as follows:

Bir kerre düşün ki valideni sevmeye ne kadar borclusun! O, seni bu boya getirinceye dek ne ağrılar, ne zahmetler çekmiş! Bütün ömründe onun için çalışsan onun sana etdiği eyliğe karşılık etmiş olmazsın. Öyle ise, bak ki, bari ona daima muhabbet ve teşekkür gösteresin⁶⁹.

"Think for a moment how much you owe to loving your mother! She has endured pains and hardships until she brought you to this age! You can never repay the kindness she has shown you throughout your life. Therefore, at least always show her love and gratitude."

In this passage, an attempt is made to persuade children to help and serve their mothers by evoking a sense of indebtedness towards them.

2. Principle of Liking

One of the most essential rules for achieving persuasion success is for the communicator to gain the affection and sympathy of their audience. Therefore, it's important for the communicator to exhibit attitudes, behaviors, and expressions that would earn the audience's fondness. This involves dressing in a way that appeals to the audience, making jokes, and paying attention to gestures and facial expressions. According to this principle, winning people's affection involves two key components: *similarity* and *compliments*. The concept of similarity is rooted in the fact that individuals tend to prefer those who resemble them in various aspects (race, language, accent, gestures, facial expressions, religion, attire, hobbies, habits, etc.). People are more easily persuaded by those who are similar to them, as they like them more. Compliments, on the other hand, are a significant factor that emotionally nourishes individuals and contributes to their survival. Research indicates that regardless of whether it's about appearance, taste, personality, habits, intelligence, etc., a communicator who gives compliments tends to be more successful in persuading the audience. Those who receive compliments tend to like those who compliment them more and are inclined to do favors for them. In short, trying to endear oneself to the audience by offering compliments and highlighting shared characteristics is crucial for persuasion. Additionally, conveying the message

⁶⁸ AÇİ, 1872, 24c/47-53

⁶⁹ AÇİ, 1872, 8b/38-46

that you truly understand the audience and share the same feelings and thoughts can further enhance persuasion success. This is because people tend to trust individuals who are similar to them to lead them in the right direction. In summary, people have an affinity for those who possess shared traits, and similarities, and those who offer compliments. They are more inclined to be persuaded by individuals they like, who are similar to them, and who provide compliments⁷⁰.

The principle of liking has been effectively employed in the passage describing the purpose of AÇİ. In an article related to New Year's in the magazine, children are addressed with a genuine understanding of their feelings. The article sincerely portrays how, during their own childhood, the writers too shared the same emotions and thoughts. The aim is to increase children's hopes and amplify their joys, by incorporating beautiful stories, pictures, and advice in the magazine. This passage highlights the intent to provide space for uplifting stories, illustrations, and guidance in order to enhance children's hopes and multiply their joys:

Biz de sizinle sevinib umarız ki sizin ol umud ettiğiniz güzel güzel şeylerin hepsi de olacak. Bizim de çocukluğumuz ve çocukluğumuzda olan umudlarımız ve arzulerimiz hatrımıza gelib sizin sevincinizi değil eksiltmek, illa artırmak isteriz. Bu sebebden işte bu tasvirli Angeliatoros'u da çıkarıyoruz (...). Sizin hepinizin -İoannis'in, Anastas'ın, İakovos'un Stefanos'ın, Mariam'ın, Evfimia'nın, Sofia'nın ve daha yüzlerce oğlanların ve kızların önümüzde bu Çocuklar Angeliatorosu'nu okuduğunu hayal ile görüb sürü ile önümüzde toplanmışsınız gibi öyle sizinle söyleşiyoruz deyu zannederiz⁷¹.

"We too rejoice with you and hope that all those beautiful things you hope for will come true. We want to bring to mind not to diminish, but rather to increase your joy, our childhood, and the hopes and desires we had during our childhood. That's why we're launching this illustrated Angeliatoros (...). We imagine that each one of you - Ioannis, Anastas, Iakovos, Stefanos, Mariam, Evfimia, Sofia, and hundreds more boys and girls - are reading this Children's Angeliatoros in front of us in a gathering, communicating with you in our minds."

In this passage, the intention is to create a sense of affection from the reader by emphasizing similarities between them.

In the following passage, children are being advised to perform acts of kindness:

Ne mutlu ol adama ki ihtiyarlığında çocukluğundan beru bütün ömründe başkalarına eylik etmiş, sefillere teselli vermiş, zaiflere yardım eylemiş ve cahillere kalaguzluk etmiş olduğunu hatrına getirebilir⁷².

"Fortunate is the person who, in their old age, can recall that since childhood, they have done good to others throughout their entire life, provided comfort to the afflicted, assisted the poor, and guided the ignorant."

In this passage, the technique of compliment (praise) has been employed to persuade children to perform acts of kindness. Those who perform acts of kindness are praised using the phrase "how fortunate" or "how happy."

⁷⁰ Cialdini, *ibid*, 2017, 181-191.

⁷¹ AÇİ, 1872, 1c/36-42-2a/1-16.

⁷² AÇİ, 1872, 30a/31-36.

3. The Principle of Social Proof

According to the principle of social proof, individuals are inclined to behave in ways that align with the beliefs, imaginations, feelings, or actions of others. People tend to think that what others do is correct. Based on this principle, when individuals witness, hear about, or sense that a large number of people are behaving in the same way, they are more likely to believe that these actions are not only ethically sound but also practically valid. The fact that something is popular or commonly observed within society leads individuals to assume that such actions are correct. This is also referred to as validity. In addition to validity, the second component of the principle of social proof is observability. Observability entails individuals knowing that the actions expected of them are also being carried out by others. People tend to find actions performed or attainable by others as more accurate and realistic. This alleviates concerns about the feasibility of such actions⁷³. In short, according to this principle, people are more easily persuaded when it comes to actions that are widely accepted within society and performed by many.

This principle is extensively used in AÇİ. Many texts in the magazine narrate real or fictional events. The correct and incorrect behaviors in these events are demonstrated, and the reader is encouraged to act similarly to those considered to have acted correctly. By highlighting that the expected actions have been previously carried out by others, it showcases the feasibility of the task. Consequently, the reader is primed to be persuaded:

Pekala, bir şey daha var: Çocuklar için neşrolunan Angeliaforos'u alsınlar deyu arkadaşlarının bazılarını kandırabilirsin. Eğer senin Angeliaforos'unu onlara gösterirsen o çok faydeli ve makbul bir gazeta olduğunu fehm edib belki onlar da birer nushe almaya haves edecekler⁷⁴.

"Alright, there's one more thing: You can convince some of your friends to get the Angeliaforos published for children. If you show them your Angeliaforos, they might understand that it's a very beneficial and worthwhile magazine, and perhaps they will also be eager to get a copy of it."

In this passage, the reader is encouraged to persuade other children to get the Angeliaforos magazine. To achieve this, the suggestion is made that the reader can show their own copy of the magazine to other children to persuade them. This technique is based on conveying to the other person the idea that having what others have or do is important. Therefore, it is suggested that using the social proof technique of persuasion is beneficial here.

Bugünlerde çocuklar haylı mahallerde ruhani resaleler (Fillada) dağıdarak çok faydeli işler görüyorlar. Sen dahi böyle bir iş yapabilirsin. Dua edib Allah'a güvenerek ruhani cüzler tanıdığın çocukların eline geçirirsen ihtimal ki ol çocuklar ol cüzleri okuyarak kendi yaramaz yollarından Allah'a dönmeye iskât olacaklar⁷⁵.

"These days, children are performing very beneficial tasks by distributing spiritual *resales* (Fillada) in many neighborhoods. You could also engage in such a task. By praying and trusting in God, if you place the spiritual brochures into the hands of children you know, it's possible that these children, upon reading the brochures, will be convinced to turn to God from their wrong paths."

⁷³ Cialdini, *ibid*, 191-195.

⁷⁴ AÇİ, 1872, 26b/2-10.

⁷⁵ AÇİ, 1872, 26a/42-50.

In the passage above, the reader is asked to distribute religious brochures conveying Protestant teachings that are prepared for children. To persuade children to do this, it is mentioned that other children have already engaged in this behavior and have thus done valuable deeds. This implies that the desired actions are valid and achievable, instilling a sense of feasibility in the reader. In this passage, the technique of social proof is used to persuade the reader.

4. The principle of Authority

The principle of authority, derived from the reflection "The message conveyed is the message itself," signifies that the communicator of a message holds significant influence in the eyes of the recipients. Apart from the content, logic, relevance to the topic, inclusion of strong evidence, etc., the identity of the messenger plays a crucial role in persuading the audience. In other words, individuals who are perceived as experts or authorities in a specific subject are generally more successful in persuading people. In addition to possessing expertise in the subject matter, another element that boosts persuasiveness is establishing trustworthiness. People assess whether the communicator is trustworthy before qualities like attractiveness, intelligence, helpfulness, compassion, and consistency. Trustworthiness implies that the communicator conveys information honestly, impartially, and regardless of whether it aligns with their personal interests. Building trust with the audience, however, takes time. Moreover, if the communicator openly acknowledges the incomplete, flawed, or harmful aspects of the topic during the communication, it enhances the communicator's power of persuasion⁷⁶.

In AÇİ, authority is often attributed to Christ. Occasionally, Bible verses have also been presented as authority. At times, the author presents themselves as an authority by describing themselves as a knowledgeable and experienced elder.

In a text where advice is given regarding harmonious and amicable relationships with friends, the words of Christ are cited as an authoritative source:

*Hristos Efendimiz gerek oyun vakti gerek başka vakıtlar için bize güzel bir nasihat vermiştir. İşte onun nasihatı: 'Ademler size her ne isterseniz ki edeler, siz de onlara öyle eyleyin.'*⁷⁷

"Our Lord Jesus has given us a beautiful piece of advice for both playtime and other times. Here is his advice: Whatever you wish that others would do to you, do also to them."

In this passage, children are advised to play nicely and show understanding towards each other without fighting. To persuade the reader on this matter, the authority of Christ has been utilized effectively.

In the following passage, the authority principle is also employed. The passage emphasizes belief in and seeking refuge in Christ. To achieve this persuasion goal, the authority principle is utilized:

Küçük çocukları Hristos'a getirenlere resuller darıldılar. Lakin İsus dedi 'Çocukları koyverin ve onları bana gelmekden men etmen.' Bundan anlaşılır ki Hristos kendi şagirdlerinin cümlesinden çok ziyade merhametlidir. Öyle ise doğru ona gitmeliyiz. Başka miyancı yahod şefaatacı aramaya hacet yok. Hristos'un şagirdleri bizi belki kovarlar deyu korkulabilir. Lakin Hristos'dan asla

⁷⁶ Cialdini, *ibid*, 2017, 195-199.

⁷⁷ AÇİ, 1872, 2c/20-26.

*korkulmaz. O bizi kovamaz. Çünkü kendisi 'Bana geleni asla dışarı çıkarmayacağım.' demiştir. İmdi hiç başkasına gitmeyelim. Doğru ona gidelim*⁷⁸.

"The apostles were displeased with those who brought little children to Jesus. However, Jesus said, 'Let the children come to me and do not hinder them.' This shows that Jesus is much more compassionate than all of his disciples. So, we should go to him directly. There is no need to seek other intermediaries or intercessors. It might be feared that Jesus' disciples could possibly reject us, but one should never fear Jesus. He will not reject us, for he has said, 'I will never drive away anyone who comes to me.' So let's not go to anyone else. Let's go directly to him."

In this passage, the authority is Christ himself and his relevant words.

In the following passage, the necessity for children to strive to become exemplary individuals is emphasized. Effort is advised to be put into this endeavor. However, it is conveyed that maturity won't happen suddenly; it requires time, and it's important to be content with one's current state:

*Bir çocuk büyük ademlerin haline arzu edib onlar gibi iyi ve faziletkâr olmak isterse Hristos'dan lutf ve kuvvet dileyib kendi halinde rast gelen işvalara karşı komaya çalışsın. Ey çocuklar, birden büyük işlere arzu etmeyin! Hristos'un sözü daima hatrınızda olsun: 'Azda emin olan kulu efendisi çok şeyler üzerine tayin eder.'*⁷⁹.

"If a child wishes to attain the character of great people and be virtuous like them, let them seek grace and strength from Christ, and strive to resist the evil they encounter in their daily life. Oh children, do not aspire to achieve great things all at once! Always remember Christ's words: 'He who is faithful in very little is faithful also in much.' Seek to be faithful in small matters first, and then greater responsibilities will come."

This approach adheres to the authority principle to persuade the reader. In such matters, Christ is the expert, and thus, by quoting His words, the intention is to convince the reader.

In AÇİ, a story is presented where a child comes to faith and then leads their father to faith. When the mischievous deeds of the child are disclosed to the father by the mother, the child, tearfully, expresses his desire for his misdeeds not to be recorded in God's book. The father informs his son that, through Christ's intercession, they can pray to God to erase his sins. In response, the child expresses his wish to pray alongside his father. Subsequently, driven by his child's request, the father prays for the child's sake and is compelled to come to faith, concluding his words as follows:

- *Eyer evladlarımıza Allah'ı tanıtmak istersek onu evvela biz bulmalıyız*⁸⁰.

"If we want to introduce God to our children, we must first find Him ourselves."

However, the father had long abandoned prayer and worship. He describes himself in the following manner:

*... çok seneler dünyayı ve onun faniliğini sevdim. Ne dua eder, ne de ibadete gider idim. Allah'a hizmet etmediğimi bilir idim ise de Allah insanları yaratmış olduğu için onları ve beni dahi mutlak helas eder deyü zanneder idim*⁸¹.

⁷⁸ AÇİ, 1872, 16c/43-58.

⁷⁹ AÇİ, 1872, 16a/18-27.

⁸⁰ AÇİ, 1872, 7c/48-50.

⁸¹ AÇİ, 1872, 7b/20-27.

"For many years, I loved the world and its transience. I neither prayed nor went to worship. Although I knew I wasn't serving God, I believed that just because God had created people, He would surely save them and even me."

In this passage, the authority figure is the narrator. According to this principle, people are inclined to be persuaded by psychologically reliable individuals. In line with this judgment, the narrator in the passage has openly admitted their own flaws without concealing them. This transparency is important in gaining the reader's trust. The use of the authority technique in this passage aims to persuade children to engage in prayer and worship.

In the passage that narrates an incident regarding the harms of alcoholic beverages, the authority principle has also been applied. The passage advises children to stay away from alcohol and refers to Bible verses that discuss the potential harm they might face if they don't.

Ey genc dostlarım, size nasihat ederim ki serhoş edici içki asla kullanmayasınız ve eyer kullanmaya başladınız ise daha kolay iken heman vazgeçmeye bakın. 'Daima hatrınızda olsun ki şarab ademin yüreğini biraz vakit ferahlandırır ise de sonunda yılan gibi ısırır ve sağır yılan gibi sancar' (Ems. 25, 32)⁸².

"My young friends, I advise you to never use alcohol, and if you have started using it, try to quit while it's easier. Always remember that 'while alcohol may momentarily lighten a person's heart, in the end, it bites like a snake and stings like a deaf adder.' (Ems. 25, 32)"

In this passage, the authority is the Holy Book.

5. Scarcity Principle

This principle is rooted in the tendency of individuals to desire scarce items more. This is because scarce items carry the risk of being lost, and people usually fear loss more than they desire gain. As a result, the perceived value of scarce items is higher in people's eyes. Techniques such as limiting production or imposing restrictions on the sale of an item can serve as examples of situations where the scarcity principle is applied⁸³.

Within the pages of AÇİ, there is a narrative depicting the rescue of a child from a ship ablaze and sinking in the middle of the sea. The individual who saves the child is a man who, after years of laboring in gold mines, returns home possessing a considerable amount of gold. The child, orphaned and unable to swim, implores the man for help in saving himself. Despite the cost of relinquishing his amassed gold, the man aids the child, ultimately preserving the child's life. This passage underscores the principle of the scarcity effect, where the man's choice to prioritize the child's life over the gold he possesses exemplifies the impact of this principle. According to this principle, individuals are inclined to attribute greater value to scarce and hard-won possessions due to the increased risk of their loss. The man's decision to forsake the gold in favor of saving the child's life highlights the greater significance of the child's life compared to the risk of losing the gold. This scenario vividly illustrates how the scarcity effect can influence human decisions and actions:

⁸² AÇİ, 1872, 13c/45-14a/1-9.

⁸³ Cialdini, *ibid*, 2017, 199-200.

Bakın çocuklar, insaniyet nefsanıyetden ne kadar eyidir! Bu adem çocuğu brakıb da altunu ile beraber karaya çıkmış bile olsaydı çocuğu telef olmaya brakdığı için bütün ömründe zamirinde rahatsızlık duyacağ ıdı⁸⁴.

"Look, children, how much better humanity is than selfishness! Even if this person had left behind the child and come ashore with his gold, he would have felt discomfort in his conscience throughout his life for not letting the child perish."

In this passage, there is an attempt to persuade individuals to embrace a sense of selflessness rather than selfishness. The passage employs the scarcity technique to convince the reader about the value of adopting the desired mindset.

In AÇİ, an incident involving a young individual with limited religious knowledge in America is recounted. The youth befriends an irreligious person, and this irreligious friend poses challenging questions about religion to the youth. However, the youth struggles to provide answers to these questions. Consequently, the friend consistently mocks the youth. During one such conversation, the youth utilizes the scarcity technique to persuade his friend:

Ben malümatlı olmadığım halde elbetde böyle süallere cevab veremem ve İngilizcede etdiğim yanlışlar için dahi size gülünc oluyorum. Lakin bundan az gün sonra büyük bir meclis olacak. İkimiz de herhalde oraya davet olunacağız. Orada size salt bir şey süal olunacak. Yani 'İsus Hristos efendimizi sever misiniz?' Ben 'Evvvet efendim!' deyebileceğim deyu umud ederim. Siz ne deyeceksiniz?'⁸⁵.

"Even though I am not knowledgeable, I certainly cannot answer such questions, and I feel embarrassed even for my mistakes in English. However, in a few days, there will be a big gathering. Both of us will probably be invited there. You will be asked only one question there. That is, 'Do you love our Lord Jesus Christ?' I hope I can say, 'Yes, I do, sir!' What will you say?"

In this passage, the youth effectively silences his interlocutor by presenting the risk of losing in the afterlife. As mentioned earlier, according to the scarcity principle, individuals are often afraid of loss, making them more inclined to persuasion. Indeed, in the continuation of the story, when confronted with the question "What will you say?" the irreligious person, after pondering, succumbs to the fear of loss and converts to faith.

In the following passage, the difficulty of acquiring a beneficial magazine like Angeliatoros is emphasized, and furthermore, its remarkably affordable price is highlighted. The scarcity technique is employed to convey that with just a small amount of money, one cannot acquire another similarly valuable magazine. This approach encourages the reader to purchase the magazine. Additionally, the passage reinforces the persuasion effort by indicating that children who read the magazine will acquire superior qualities compared to their peers:

Bir çocuk bir beşlik ile bu Angeliatoros gibi faideli bir başka gazeta alabilmesi memul olunmaz. Bu gazetayı okuyan çocuklar ilme havasli ve dindar olub her hususda ileri gitmeyi öyrenecekler⁸⁶.

⁸⁴ AÇİ, 1872, 3b/4-119.

⁸⁵ AÇİ, 1872, 4a/13-24.

⁸⁶ AÇİ, 1872, 26b/15-21.

"A child cannot obtain another beneficial magazine like this Angeliatoros with just five cents. The children who read this magazine will become eager for knowledge and become religious, and they will learn to progress in every matter."

The passage below narrates the story of a man who rescues the people aboard a sinking ship. This man manages to save the people on the ship and brings them safely ashore with his horse. Unfortunately, during their final attempt, when both he and his horse are exhausted, they both drown. This story aims to evoke feelings of selflessness and altruism in the reader.

*Vakaa, acınacak seyran! Atın sahibi olan cesur adem, bir olandız ıdı ve böyle kendi ömrünü başkaların uğrına feda etdi. Onun bu hareketi ne kadar tacübe ve medhe şayandır. Bu adem insanların helası için kanını döken Hristos'a benzemez mi?*⁸⁷.

"The incident, a pitiable spectacle! The brave man who owned the horse was an engineer (?), and he sacrificed his own life for the sake of others. How commendable and praiseworthy is his action! Doesn't this man resemble Christ, who shed his blood for the salvation of humanity?"

In this passage, it is conveyed that individuals who possess the courage to sacrifice their lives for the salvation of others, along with a sense of selflessness and altruism, are rare. Hence, it is stated that these individuals resemble Christ. The use of the scarcity principle is evident in this passage, suggesting that such selfless individuals are scarce among people, thus implying their value. This notion is further reinforced by including Christ in the discourse, as He stands unique among humanity.

6. Principle of Consistency

The Principle of Consistency is based on the innate desire of individuals to appear consistent and genuine. Despite exhibiting contradictory behaviors in the real world, people generally do not wish to engage in actions that contradict their own thoughts or statements, and they are uncomfortable with others witnessing such inconsistencies. This principle relies on compelling the recipient to act consistently, thereby ensuring the acceptance of the message by the communicator. To achieve this, the communicator first elicits the recipient's feelings and thoughts related to the subject. Subsequently, efforts are made to persuade the recipient to engage in actions aligned with these feelings and thoughts. Individuals who are keen on avoiding inconsistencies between their expressed emotions and actions are more easily persuaded⁸⁸.

In AÇİ, it can be observed that the technique of consistency is employed to encourage children to fulfill the requirements of their faith in Christ. In the following passage, the importance of consistent behavior is emphasized for children who claim to believe in Christ, urging them to align their actions with Christ's messages:

*'Hristos'a inanır mısın?' deyu sana soracak olursam ihtimaldir ki 'Evvet, inanırım.' deyeceksin. (...) Pekala, amma şeytan da öyle inanır. Lakin helas olmaz. Gerçekden Hristos'a inanmak, onu kurtarıcı deyu kabul edib onun emrine ve tenbihlerine teknil itaat etmekle olur*⁸⁹.

⁸⁷ AÇİ, 1872, 6c/26-32.

⁸⁸ Cialdini, *ibid.*, 2017, 200-202.

⁸⁹ AÇİ, 1872, 2b/17-30.

"If I were to ask you, 'Do you believe in Christ?' it's likely that you would say, 'Yes, I do.' (...) Alright, but even the devil believes that way. However, that's not enough. Truly believing in Christ involves accepting Him as your Savior and fully obeying His commands and teachings."

In this passage, the inconsistency of the reader, who claims to have a different faith from Satan, not obeying the commands of Christ as opposed to Satan, is presented as a contradiction. The reader is encouraged to be consistent by being convinced of the necessity to pray and worship, aligning their behavior accordingly.

In the dialogue between the father and his son Ioannis below, the father has utilized the technique of consistency to persuade his son:

(Ioannis):

- ... *Ben de böyüyüb onlar gibi işvalara karşı koyayım ve ağır zahmetler çekeyim. Bu yaşımda büyük bir şey yapamam, dedi.*

Babası ona:

- *Eyi düşün İoannis, bu yaşında yapacak işin yahod yenecek bir huyun yok mıdır, dedikde İoannis başını asıb:*

- *Evvet, baba, bilirim. Çok defa yaramazlık edeyorım. Fena hallerde bulunuyorum ve kendimi yenemeyorım. Amma ben Avraam gibi, David gibi ve İlias gibi büyük zahmetler çekmek ve keskin işvalar ile oğraşmak isterim. Böyle hallerde üst olmak daha büyük şan değil mi, deyu cevap verdi.*

Babası yine gülerek dedi:

- *Öyle ise sen zannedeyorsın ki şimdi huylarını yenemeyib de böyüyüb adem olursan isimlerini verdiği o meşhur ademler gibi birden eyi ve cesur olacaksın, öyle mi? Bilmeyor mısın ki o ademler azar azar ol dereceye girdiler⁹⁰.*

“(Ioannis)

- ‘I want to grow up and resist evil like they do, and endure many hardships’, he said.

His father responded:

- ‘Think carefully, Ioannis. At your age, is there something you can do or a bad habit you can overcome?’ When his father asked, Ioannis lowered his head and said, ‘Yes, father, I know. Many times, I misbehave. I find myself in bad situations and can't overcome them. But I want to endure great hardships and contend with great evils like Abraham, David, and Elijah. Isn't overcoming such situations a greater honor?’ he replied.

His father, still smiling, said, ‘So you believe that growing up and becoming a man like those famous figures you mentioned will suddenly make you good and courageous, right?’ Don't you know that those men gradually reached that level?"

In this passage, the father conveys the message that waiting to grow up is not necessary for his son to be a good person; he suggests that one should strive to be a good person from now on. He points out that someone with current flaws might still have flaws when they grow up, implying that

⁹⁰ AÇİ, 1872, 15b/6-25.

to be a good person, one should work on rectifying their current shortcomings. By utilizing the technique of consistency, he emphasizes that those who address their flaws now will likely become exemplary individuals even as they mature.

In some instances in AÇİ, the principle of consistency is also attempted to be achieved by posing questions to the reader. Assuming that everyone views themselves as good, intelligent, and rational individuals, the reader is guided through the question of which actions to choose between right and wrong. For instance, during a cholera outbreak in Istanbul, an event is described where an elderly woman fainted on a bridge. According to the narrative, fearing contagion, the people passing by were unwilling to help her. Instead, they left her in an old boat nearby and moved on. However, in the morning, a few European workers passing by took pity on her, took her to a house, and with the help of compassionate women in the house, provided her with medicine to recover. Later in the passage, the question is posed to the children whether believing in Christ is the right choice, implying the value of consistent beliefs and actions:

*Hristos'un ruhu ile insanların zat-ı tabiyatı arasında olan fark işte budur. Siz bu iki tarz hareketin kangısını makbul tutarsınız ve onların kangısı gibi etmek istersiniz?*⁹¹.

"The difference between the spirit of Christ and the nature of humans lies here. Which of these two ways of acting do you consider commendable, and which one would you like to follow, like them?"

Those who consider themselves kind-hearted, intelligent, and rational will naturally strive for consistency and follow the path of Christ. They will also attempt to guide others onto this path.

7. The Principle of Unity

The principle of unity consists of two components: Being together and acting together. Individuals are more inclined to be persuaded by those they are with compared to when they are alone. There are various elements of being together, including kinship (physical and biological similarity), proximity (physical closeness), local ties (sharing a hometown), and regional identity (being from the same geographical region). Research indicates that factors such as having relatives or feelings of kinship with others, living in the same or nearby geographical areas, or having some form of connection with those areas enhance the sense of shared identity among people, thereby facilitating their persuasion of each other. Furthermore, even when individuals collaborate with strangers, they tend to establish a sense of similarity with them through the act of working together, leading to a growing fondness for them due to the resulting sense of unity. The increase in the sense of similarity consequently boosts the feeling of liking, which positively contributes to the persuasion process. Engaging in activities like exercising together, keeping pace, listening to music, reciprocating kindness (gift-giving), engaging in joint creative efforts (such as planting a tree together), and seeking advice from others are suitable efforts for acting together. These efforts contribute to enhancing the success of persuasion⁹².

In a passage from AÇİ, it is recounted that in Scotland, a child is offered a tip to collect rare flowers growing at the edge of a cliff. To gather the flowers, the child needs to be lowered down the cliff with a rope tied around their waist. The child agrees to the proposition under the condition that the end of the rope is held by his father, ensuring their safety for this perilous task. This scenario

⁹¹ AÇİ, 1872, 8c/24-29.

⁹² Cialdini, *ibid*, 2017, 205-245.

demonstrates an approach in line with the principle of unity. The father and son, bound together by their kinship, cooperate and align their actions to fulfill the desired behavior. The passage extrapolates from this event, suggesting that just as in this situation where a father and son work together, Hristos, portrayed as a trustworthy figure like a father, offers safety. The passage concludes by conveying the idea that in this hazardous world, we find security only when we entrust ourselves to the hands of Hristos.

Bu çocuğun babasına emniyeti 'can kurtaran iman'a güzel bir temsildir. Nasıl ki mezkür çocuk arzu olunan çiçekleri koparmaya gittiğinde bağlanacağı ip babasının elinde olursa emin olur idi. Öyle de biz bu tehlikeli dünyada kendimizi ancak Hristos'un eline teslim ettiğimiz halde emin olabiliriz⁹³.

"The security of this child to his father represents the 'life-saving faith.' Just as the mentioned child, when going to pluck the desired flowers, had the rope tied to his father's hand for safety, similarly, in this perilous world, we can only be safe if we entrust ourselves to the hand of Christ."

In another passage directed towards those who are hesitant about which religion or denomination to embrace as the correct one, the emphasis is placed on the collective sentiment of "we." Throughout the text, the term "we" is employed to create a sense of shared belief with the reader. The term "we" signifies genuine Christians (as specifically understood to refer to Protestants, as noted by Kocabaşođlu⁹⁴).

Sahih Hristianları temsilen göstermek için Hristos koyunları seçti ve kendisi için dahi 'Eyi çobanım.' dedi. Bu, bize koyunların kendi çobanının sesini tanıyıp başkasının ardınca gitmediği emsal, sahif Hristianlar dahi kendilerinin biricik çobanı ve kurtarıcılarını tanıyıp aldanamaz olduklarını öyredir⁹⁵.

"As a representation of true Christians, Christ chose the sheep and even said, 'You are My good shepherd.' Just as the sheep recognize the voice of their own shepherd and do not follow another's, genuine Christians also learn that they recognize their one true shepherd and Savior, and are not deceived."

⁹³ AÇİ, 1872, 16b/17-26.

⁹⁴ Kocabaşođlu, *ibid.*, 2023.

⁹⁵ AÇİ, 1872, 20c/27-36.

Conclusion

Commencing their activities in the Ottoman territories in 1820, the ABCFM missionaries employed various means to accomplish their religious objectives, including education, healthcare, press, and social assistance. Among these methods, one of the most effective proved to be their publishing endeavors. These publications held significant importance, as they believed that through their publishing efforts, they could remain impactful even in situations where they were not physically present, in order to sustain their missionary activities. Utilizing printing presses established in cities such as Malta, Izmir, and Istanbul, they engaged in a substantial publication campaign until the late 19th century, covering millions of pages in languages including Armenian, Armenian-scripted Turkish, Greek, Greek-scripted Turkish, Bulgarian, Arabic-scripted Turkish, and Ladino.

In our assessment, one of the reasons behind the effectiveness of ABCFM missionaries in the Ottoman territories lies not only in the quantity of their publishing efforts but also in their persuasive nature. Their ability to influence and persuade target audiences through their publications played a crucial role in achieving their missionary goals. This underscores the pivotal role of their persuasive skills through publications in attaining their missionary objectives.

In this study, "AÇI" occupies a distinctive position within ABCFM publications due to its consistent content across various languages over extended periods. Through the lens of Cialdini's principles of persuasion, this study has conducted an analysis. The findings illustrate that the texts within "AÇI" are structured in accordance with Cialdini's known persuasion principles: *reciprocity*, *liking*, *social proof*, *authority*, *scarcity*, *consistency*, and *unity*. Nearly all the texts within the journal appear to incorporate one or more of these persuasion principles. This discovery highlights the awareness and deliberate utilization of these persuasion principles by the journal's authors and editors, emphasizing the journal's particularly noteworthy persuasive strategies⁹⁶.

For future research, a linguistic examination of the persuasion discourse utilized in ABCFM publications is recommended. Such an analysis could assist us in better understanding the persuasive impact of the language used in ABCFM publications.

⁹⁶ Certainly, the adherence of journal authors to these principles does not necessarily imply awareness of Cialdini, who systematized methods already practiced by individuals through experience or thought processes in the 20th century. Due to temporal differences, such awareness would naturally be implausible. Nevertheless, the findings of the study indicate that journal authors make a concerted effort to align with persuasive principles.

References

- Aksu, Ayşe, *Osmanlı'da İki Amerikalı – Misyoner Levi Parkons ve Pliny Fisk'in Anadolu ve Kudüs Seyahat Raporları*, İstanbul: Dergah, 2015.
- Aksu, Ayşe, *Robert Kolej'in İzinde – Türkiye'de Amerikan Misyonerliğinin Eğitim Stratejisi*, İstanbul: Dergah, 2017.
- Aksu, Ayşe “The Education Activities of American Missionaries in Ottoman Anatolia (1820-1900) and its Effects on Ottoman Social Structure”, PhD. Thesis, Marmara University, 2010.
- Alan, Gülbadi, *Merzifon Amerikan Koleji ve Anadolu'daki Etkileri*, Ankara: TTK, 2008a.
- Alan, Gülbadi, *Misyonerlik Karşısında Osmanlı Devleti'nin Politikaları*, Kayseri: Arka Oda Yayınları, 2008b.
- Alan, Gülbadi, *Sultan II. Abdülhamid'in Hristiyan Misyonerleri ve Kurumlarına Karşı Takip Ettiği Politikalar*, ed. Metin Hülügü, Kayseri: Erciyes Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2011, 213-256.
- Alan, Gülbadi. *Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda Amerikan Protestan Okulları*. Ankara: TTK, 2015.
- Alan, Gülbadi. *Amerikan Board Örgütünün Dünyası. Osmanlı'dan Cumhuriyet'e Türkiye'de Misyonerler ve Faaliyetleri*, eds. Yunus Emre Tekinsoy, Murat Hanılçe, İstanbul: Kitabevi Yayınları, 2018, 55-95.
- Alan, Gülbadi, “Protestan Amerikan Misyonerleri, Anadolu'daki Rumlar ve Pontus Meselesi.” *Erciyes Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 10 (2001): 183-208.
- Altuntaş, Mehmet, “Karamanlı Türkçesinde Yayımlanan Angeliatoros Çocuklar İçün (1872-1896) Dergisinin Analitik Bibliyografyası”, Master's Thesis, Kırklareli University, 2021.
- Anzerlioğlu, Yonca, “Tarihi verilerle Karamanlı Ortodoks Türkler”, *Türk Kültürü ve Hacı Bektaşî Veli Araştırma Dergisi*, 51, (2009):171-188.
- Anzerlioğlu, Yonca, *Karamanlı Ortodoks Türkler*. Ankara: Phoenix, 2016.
- ARIT-I. <http://dlir.org/eresources/93-american-board-periodical-collection.html> (Access on 20.07.2021).
- Balta, Evangelia, “Anadolu Turkofon Hristiyan Ortodoksların Ulusal Bilinçlerini Araştırmaya Yarayan Bir Kaynak Olarak Karamanlîca Kitapların Önsözleri”, trans. Herkül Milas, *Tarih ve Toplum*, 74, (1990):18-20.
- Balta, Evangelia, “A Notebook on the History of the Karamanli Press”, eds, Evangelia Balta, Georgios Salakidis and Theoaris Stavrides, In *Studies Ottoman Empire and Turkey*, İstanbul: The Isis Press, 2014, 61-83.
- Balta, Evangelia, *Gerçi Rum İsek de, Rumca Bilmez Türkçe Söyleriz: Karamanlılar ve Karamanlîca Edebiyat Üzerine Araştırmalar*, trans. Herkül Millas et al. İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Kültür Yayınları, 2012.
- Benlisoy, Stefo, “Education in the Turcophone Orthodox Communities of Anatolia During in the Nineteenth Century”, PhD diss., Boğaziçi University, 2010.

- Canyaş, Hüseyin and Canyaş, F. Orkunt, "Osmanlı'dan Günümüze Misyonerlerin Kültürel Alandaki Faaliyetleri" *Türklük Bilimi Araştırmaları (TÜBAR)*, 31(2012): 55-75.
- Cialdini, Robert B. *İknaya Açılan Kapı*, Trans. Taner Gezer, İstanbul: MediaCat Kitapları, 2017.
- Cialdini, Robert B. (2023). *İknanın Psikolojisi*. Trans. Fevzi Yalım, İstanbul: MediaCat, 2023.
- Coakley, James, "Printing Offices of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions, 1816-1900: A Synopsis." *Harvard Library Bulletin* 9/1, (Spring 1998): 5-34. <https://nrs.harvard.edu/URN-3:HUL.INSTREPOS:37363511>.
- Constitutions, laws and regulations of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions*. Boston, 1839.
- Doğan, Mehmet Ali and Sharkey, Heather J., (eds.) *American Missionaries in the Middle East: Foundational Encounters*. Salt Lake City: The University of Utah Press, 2011.
- Eckmann, Janos, "Karaman Edebiyatı", In *Türk Dünyası Edebiyatı I*, prep. Halil Açıkgöz, İstanbul: Türk Dünyası Araştırmaları Vakfı, 1991, 20-37.
- Eddy, David Brewer, *What Next in Turkey - Glimpses of the American Board's Work in the Near East*, Boston: American Board, 1913.
- Eröz, Mehmet, *Hiristiyanlaşan Türkler*. Ankara: Türk Kültürünü Araştırma Enstitüsü, 1983.
- Göktürk, Gülen, "Well-Preserved Boundaries: Faith and Co-Existence in the Late Ottoman Empire" PhD diss., Middle East Technical University, 2015.
- Güngör, Erol, *Türkiye'de Misyonerlik Faaliyetleri*, İstanbul: Ötüken, 1999.
- Hutchison, William R., *Errand to the World: American Protestant Thought and Foreign Missions*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1987.
- Irakleous, Stelios, "Sociolinguistic Aspects of Αγγελιαφόρος Τζοτζουκλάρ ιτζούν 1872-1896." ed. Evangelia Balta. In *Cultural Encounters in the Turkish-Speaking Communities of the Late Ottoman Empire*, İstanbul: Isis Press, 2014a, 393-410.
- Irakleous, Stelios, "The Contents of the Periodical Αγγελιαφόρος Τζοτζουκλάρ ιτζούν. The First Decade (1872-1880)." eds. Evangelia Balta, Georgios Salakidis and Theoharis Stavrides. In *Festschrift in honor of Ioannis P. Theocharides - Studies on the Ottoman Empire and Turkey II*, İstanbul: Isis Press, 2014b, 155-197.
- İbar, Gazanfer, *Anadolu Hemşehrilerimiz Karamanlılar ve Yunan Harfli Türkçe*, İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Kültür yayımları, 2010.
- Kahraman, Nazan, "Amerikan Protestan Misyonerlerin Osmanlı Coğrafyasına Yönelik İlk Matbaası Malta (1822-1833)", *Ankara Üniversitesi İLEF Dergisi*, 7/1(2020): 96-136.
- Kahya, Hayrullah, "Grek Harfli Osmanlı Türkçesi Bir Eser: İspat-ı Mesihiye Üzerinde Dil İncelemesi", Master's Thesis, Fatih University, 2003.
- Kahya, Hayrullah, "Karamanlıca Bir Kitap Yeñi Hazne Ve Dil Özellikleri (İmlâ Özellikleri Ve Ses Bilgisi)", *Turkish Studies* 3/6(2008): 367-408.

- Kahya, Hayrullah, *Karamanlıca Resimli Bir Çocuk Dergisi: Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçin (1872)*. Ankara: Grafiker Yayınları, 2017.
- Karabıçak, Yusuf Ziya, “Angeliaforos Çocuklar İçin ve Osmanlı Devleti’nde Yayımlanan Diğer Çocuk Gazeteleri: Modern Çocukluk Söyleminin Oluşumu,” *Toplumsal Tarih*, 215 (2011): 2-11.
- Kieser, Hans-Lukas, *Nearest East: American Millennialism and Mission to the Middle East*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2010.
- Kocabaşoğlu, Uygur, *Anadolu’daki Amerika – Kendi Belgeleriyle 19. Yüzyılda Osmanlı İmparatorluğu’ndaki Amerikan Misyoner Okulları*. 4. bs. Ankara: İmge Kitabevi, 2023.
- Kocabaşoğlu, Uygur. “Osmanlı İmparatorluğu’nda XIX. yüzyılda Amerikan matbaaları ve Yayımcılığı”, eds. Aydın Aybay, Rona Aybay, In *Murat Sarıca Armağanı*, İstanbul: Aybay Yayınları, 1988, 267-287.
- Makdisi, Ussama, *Artillery of Heaven: American Missionaries and the Failed Conversion of the Middle East*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2008.
- McAlister, Melani, *Epic Encounters: Culture, Media, and U.S. Interests in the Middle East, 1945-2000*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001.
- Mutlu, Şamil, *Osmanlı Devleti’nde Misyoner Okulları*. İstanbul: Gökkuşbu, 2005.
- Öney, Celal, *Osmanlı Suriyesi’nde Misyonerlik Faaliyetleri*. Ankara: Maarif Mektepleri, 2019.
- Öztürk, Ayhan, American Board’ın Kuruluşu, Teşkilatlanması Ve Osmanlı Devletinde Kurduğu Misyonerler, *Erciyes Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 2, (2007): 63-74.
- Richter, Julius, *A History of Protestant Missions in The Near East*, London 1910.
- Roper, Geoffrey, “The Beginnings of Arabic Printing by the ABCFM, 1822-1841”, *Harvard Library Bulletin*, 9/1 (Spring 1998): 50-68. <https://dash.harvard.edu/handle/1/37363517>.
- Saatci İzci, Büşra and Halaç, Hicran Hanım, “Bibliometric Analysis of The American Board Missionary Organization”. *Turkish Academic Research Review*, 7/1, (2022): 97-118. <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/tarr/issue/68995/1017465>.
- Sharkey, Heather J. “American Missionaries in Ottoman Lands: Foundational Encounters”, (2010). https://repository.upenn.edu/nelc_papers/19.
- Sharkey, Heather J, *American Evangelicals in Egypt: Missionary Encounters in an Age of Empire*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2008.
- Stone, Frank A. *Sömürgeciliğin Hasat Mevsimi Anadolu’da Amerikan Misyoner Okulları*. Trans. Ayşe Aksu, İstanbul: Dergah, 2023.
- Strauss, Johann, “Who Read What in the Ottoman Empire (19th-20th Centuries)?” *Middle Eastern Literatures*, 6/1 (2003): 39-76.
- Şahin, Emrah *Faithful Encounters: Authorities and American Missionaries in the Ottoman Empire*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2018.

- Taşkın, Faruk, “Amerikan Board Misyonerlerinin Türkiye’deki Sağlık Faaliyetleri (1833-1923)”, *Avrasya İncelemeleri Dergisi*, VI/2 (2017): 149-176.
- Tozlu, Necmettin, *Kültür ve Eğitim Tarihinde Yabancı Okullar*, Ankara: Akçağ Yayınları, 1991
- Yılmaz, Eray, “Türkçe çocuk gazetelerinde Osmanlı kimliği (1869-1908) (Ahlak, ilim, dil, tarih ve coğrafya)”, PhD. Diss., Yıldız Technical University, 2015.
- Yücel, İdris, “Anadolu’daki Amerikan Hastaneleri ve Tıbbi Misyonerlik (1880-1930)”, PhD. Diss., Hacettepe University, 2011.
- Yücel, İdris, “Kendi Belgeleri Işığında Amerikan Boardın Osmanlı Ülkesindeki Teşkilatlanması”, Master’s Thesis, Erciyes University, 2005.